

RUSSIA AND TURKEY: FROM CONFRONTATION TO COOPERATION

*Yermekbayev A¹. Abzhaparova L².

¹PhD. Assistant professor, al-Farabi Kazakh National University Almaty, Kazakhstan

E-mail: adilbeke@gmail.com

²PhD. assistant professor, Ablai Khan KazUIRandWL,

Almaty, Kazakhstan

e-mail: laura_zh83@mail.ru

Annotation. The article is devoted to the relations between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Turkey. The partnership of the two states at the present stage, whose history is full of war and geopolitical confrontation, adhering to contradictory policies, takes a step towards considering international relations as a unique phenomenon. The scientific work examines the stages of development, the current state and prospects of relations between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Turkey.

At the present stage, serious changes are taking place in international relations, the emergence of new players in the post-bipolar world, their relations with traditional centers of power are now in the focus of attention of researchers.

The very high rates of development of political processes taking place in the world, and the events taking place sometimes make it difficult to define them from the point of view of the theory of international relations. We believe that Russia and Turkey play an important role in the modern system of international relations. It is obvious that the formation of the two states as leading actors in world politics and activity in international politics began at the beginning of the XXI century. The development of close relations between Russia and Turkey has become an urgent area of scientific research.

Keywords: Russia, Turkey, confrontation, geopolitics, neo-ottomanism, putinism.

Basic provisions

If you look at the history of Russia and Turkey, you can see that there are common features in the development of the two states, firstly, in both states, transcontinental empires are considered the heirs. It is obvious that the policy of Ankara and Moscow to become new centers of power in the modern world causes fears of Western countries, primarily the United States. There are also thoughts that the rapprochement of Turkey and Russia is the basis of the anti-social policy of the two states. As you know, the possibility of a long-term partnership between two geographically close geopolitical centers today depends on the predominance of historical stereotypes of the pragmatic policy of the two states. We believe that reaching a new level of development of modern relations between the two states with similar cycles of historical development will become one of the most relevant areas of research in international politics.

There is every reason to believe that the development of relations between Moscow and Ankara may affect the future of current problems in international relations. It is known that Nagorno-Karabakh, the Crimean issue, and most

importantly, one of the most important players of Turkey and Russia in the protracted Syrian crisis. We believe that the current partnership of the two states at this stage can contribute to the solution of the above issues, if it becomes a long-term prospect. At the same time, at a time of aggravation of contradictions between Russia and NATO, Russia's close contacts with Turkey remain the only mechanism of Moscow-Brussels relations.

We believe that, although the XXI century is a period of new opportunities for the development of Kazakhstan, it is necessary to take into account that such threats as terrorism, extremism, cyberterrorism, unfavorable market conditions are not dispersed. Russia and Turkey are of high importance in the foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, they are strategic partners of our country in both countries. The relevance of the research topic is emphasized by the fact that Russia and Turkey occupy a special place in the economic stability, security and development of Kazakhstan.

Kazakhstan attaches great importance to relations with the Republic of Turkey after the collapse of the USSR. In this sense, relations with Kazakhstan have always occupied a special place in Turkey's foreign policy. Turkey was one of the first to recognize the independence of Kazakhstan, highly appreciating the optimal changes achieved by our country in a short period after gaining independence, as well as the special place and strengthening of Kazakhstan's independence in the international arena. The constructive dialogue between Kazakhstan and Turkey continues at the multilateral level - within the framework of the UN, the Economic Cooperation Organization, the Organization of Islamic Cooperation, the OSCE, the CICA, the Cooperation Council of Turkic-speaking States and other associations. This also confirms the relevance of this topic.

Introduction

The Russian Federation positions the relations between Kazakhstan's largest partner, Nur-Sultan and Moscow as a strategic partnership, union relations. The fact that Russia occupies the first place in Kazakhstan's relations in foreign trade, economic, defense, humanitarian and other spheres indicates that relations with the Russian Federation are important for our country. We know that one of the largest associations in the world is the result of the initiatives of Russia and Kazakhstan on the basis of the Eurasian Economic Union. Kazakh-Russian relations are of great and strategic importance for the Eurasian Economic Union. The visit of President Kassym-Jomart Tokayev to Moscow showed that the development of economic relations between the two countries will continue in the same direction and is of great importance for the Eurasian Economic Union. This indicates the large-scale relevance of the topic.

Russia is the largest trade, economic and political partner of Kazakhstan and has common positions in world politics. For example, on issues of international terrorism, drug trafficking, Syria, Afghanistan, Venezuela, the positions of the two countries are united, as can be seen from the results of meetings and voting under the auspices of

the UN. The fact that Kazakhstan did not support Russia's position in the Crimean messel, which is important for Russia now, did not lead to a deterioration in relations between the two countries, but supported Russia by voting against Moscow's resolution on human rights violations in Crimea. The Crimean issue has become a serious challenge to the multi-vector policy of Kazakhstan as a whole for the strength of relations between the two countries. The Crimean issue, and then the economic sanctions imposed against Russia, also had a negative impact on the economy of Kazakhstan. The opening of the Turkish market to Russia at a time when, after the sanctions, Russia's economic relations between the countries of the European Union and the United States deteriorated, helped to preserve the stability of the Russian economy. Given the close ties of the Kazakh economy with its northern neighbor, the existence of normal relations between Russia and Turkey can show the relevance of the topic for both Kazakhstan and Kazakhstan.

Nur-Sultan's desire to restore relations between Ankara and Moscow underlines the importance of Russia and Turkey for us. Thanks to the far-sighted and skillful mediation policy of the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Elbasy N. A. Nazarbayev, relations between Ankara and Moscow have been restored and have begun to develop at a new pace. It is important for Kazakhstan that Russia and Turkey are important partners in the transportation of goods and raw materials of the Republic of Kazakhstan and have normal relations between Moscow and Ankara. Therefore, there is reason to believe that the study of the main problems and prospects for the development of relations between Russia and Turkey can become one of the most relevant areas in domestic science.

Description of materials and methods

The topic of research is one of the most important areas in the field of international relations, Relations between the two countries have received a place in many scientific articles and studies, due to the wide variety of research topics, we decided to divide research in this direction into several groups:

Researchers of relations between Russia and Turkey in the work of P. V. Shlykov and N. Y. Ulchenko assess the relations between Russia and Turkey, which began in the 2000s, as a "golden period" of friendship. In the course of a comprehensive analysis of bilateral relations between Russia and Turkey, he writes that "the pragmatism of mutual interest has helped Moscow and Ankara to reduce the negative impact of unstable international conditions and resolve the sharp corners of political and economic relations." Considering the possibilities of promoting bilateral cooperation to a higher level, the authors comprehensively analyze the current state of the political dialogue between Moscow and Ankara, the factors of development and stagnation of trade and economic relations, possible forms of interaction in geopolitically significant regions [1].

The issue of studying relations in the field of energy between Russia and Turkey has been deeply studied within Turkish scientists, among the authors who have made their contribution in this direction, T. Demiryol (Demiryol T.) [2].

Assessing the risks in energy relations, he noted, "The tension in relations between Turkey and Russia in recent years has been caused by the asymmetric relations that have developed between the two countries and the combination of two entities that are geopolitical interests within these borders. The strategy of asymmetric interdependence was the basis for political cooperation when it worked well and had import dependence. On the other hand, energy relations based on the asymmetry and dynamics of competition arise when the differentiation of geopolitical interests violates the mechanism of existence and ensures the security of import dependence."

We consider it necessary to note that the works of Milat Celikpala, one of the well-known European researchers among Turkish scientists, helped Turkey in studying energy strategy, energy security and energy diplomacy resulting from it. Erşen E made a great contribution to the study of the formation and strategy of the future policy in the energy sector of Turkey. In his work, the author reveals the main points of the development of relations in the energy sector [3-4].

Under the asymmetric threat of relations between Turkey and Russia, the work of the following author should be noted. Z. Onish [5] in his work, the two countries emphasize the potential of asymmetric relations, geopolitical, geo-economic conflicts between Turkey and Russia, and also warn of the need to observe a pragmatic policy in relations with Moscow.

Researchers of the modern foreign policy doctrine of Turkey assess "neo-Ottomanism", President Erdogan has repeatedly openly stated that he is an adherent of this neo-Ottomanism policy. However, the term "Neo-Ottomanism" refers to the 70s of the last century. With Greek authors. The policy of the Turkish Republic's conquest of Northern Cyprus and the proclamation of the unrecognized Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus there was regarded as a manifestation of the policy of the former Ottoman Empire.

Kerstin Rebekah Bouveng, one of the critics of the study of the ideological basis of Russian foreign policy [6]. In his work, exploring the idea of Messianism in Russia's foreign policy, "various forms of Messianism have entered the Russian worldview-it is presented as political and imperial, spiritually as the concept of "Holy Russia", and geopolitically as Eurasianism. Messianism is based on the idea of a chosen nation, but at the same time it surpasses the pessimistic idea of a nation with its universal requirement, since this excerpt from Russian political discourse gives an assessment: nationalism is an idea for small nations that are afraid of extinction." The value of this author's work lies in the fact that he analyzes the influence of the ideas of Messianism in foreign policy on each period of Russian/Soviet history.

The Polish author Justina Doroszczyk considers the problem of Russian Messianism. In her work, unlike the previous author, the Polish specialist writes that the reason that Russia will never have constructive, allied relations with Western countries follows from the fact that the idea of "Moscow of the Third Rome" is anti-batistic. At the same time, the opinion is expressed that for Russia the idea of Pan-Slavism has gone forever with the wave of history. However, both authors do not write that the idea of Messianism that took place in Russia's foreign policy is derived

from Western countries, and even the idea of Messianism existed in Poland itself. Of course, we do not exclude that the works of both authors may be influenced by the current situation in modern politics [7].

Hungarian author A. Gereben, a researcher of Russia's energy policy, expressed the opinion that Moscow's actions in the energy market are a purely political tool, not an economy, and, according to the author, calls on European countries to cooperate with Turkey in order to counter Russia's economic oppression. According to the researcher, if an energy consortium is not created between Turkey and the EU countries, then the "weapons" in the hands of Russia will be used against European countries [8].

Results

The theory of political realism or neorealism was used in the study of the country's foreign policy and its actions in the international arena, guided by the national interests of Russia and Turkey. The principles of this school made it possible to comprehensively consider the principles of state interests, political ideology, geopolitics, security and interdependence. In addition, the principles of the school of neorealism were used to determine the symmetry and asymmetry of economic interdependence in Russian-Turkish relations.

The topic of the article is considered in the context of a systematic interdisciplinary approach, which includes the results of political, economic, historical research, as well as a significant number of sources that allow determining the prerequisites for the formation of Russian-Turkish relations. .

To find the most optimal solutions to the problem, the main methodological approaches were identified through the use of fundamental works of domestic and foreign researchers in the field of political, historical and economic sciences.

The systematic approach, along with the strategic interests of international actors, allows us to track the development of problematic moments, which allows us to more fully identify trends and, in particular, to study possible options for the development of the situation.

Based on the comparative historical analysis, the main stages and trends in the development of Turkish-Russian relations are identified.

Discussions

The ideologies that have played an important role in the long-term relations between the two countries not only determine the origins of conflicts and geopolitical rivalry in the history of Turkish-Russian relations, but also contribute to the current disagreements and distrust between Ankara and Moscow.

The beginning of a new era in relations between Moscow and Ankara at the beginning of the XXI century coincided with internal political changes in the two countries, indicating that Turkey and Russia have moved from ideological differences to a pragmatic policy.

Energy relations are one of the strategic directions between Moscow and Ankara, and this has led to a symmetry of interdependence. The energy sector in Russian-Turkish relations is a direction that continues to develop, despite political differences, and can become a stable basis for future relations between the two countries.

Although Russia has a high rate of development of military and security relations with Turkey, this cannot be considered as one of the fundamental factors of relations. Russian-Turkish military-military relations do not affect the policy of the Turkish bloc. - Strengthening of relations can be assessed as non-strategic tactical relations.

The geopolitical interests of Turkey and Russia in the Middle East, including the civil war in Syria and the Kurdish issue, do not lead to new conflicts between the two countries after the military incident on November 24, 2015. The rapprochement of the positions of Moscow and Ankara on Syria and the Kurdish language is marked by mutual tolerance.

The results of the policies of Georgia and Ukraine in 2008 and 2014, along with the strengthening of Russia's position in the Black Sea region, led to a decline in Moscow's prestige in world politics. The strengthening of Russia is bad for Turkey, but the importance of energy relations is that in the future there will be a tendency to turn the Black Sea region into a special sphere of influence for the two countries;

The policy of the two countries in Central Asia is based on the positions of other forces outside the region, and the threat of China's increasing economic influence in Central Asia will contribute to the rapprochement of Russian-Turkish positions in regional politics in the future.

Conclusion

We believe that the second direction of the development of Russian-Turkish relations today is the military-defense partnership. In the course of studying this issue, we examined the history of arms trade in bilateral relations, as well as the recent acquisition of military air defense systems by Ankara, which caused controversy among NATO partners. Despite Ankara's assurances that NATO membership will protect it from external enemies, attempts were made to determine the purpose of Russia's purchase of the S-400 system. We considered it appropriate to assess the defense partnership between Ankara and Moscow as tactical, not strategic. It was argued that the arms trade between Russia and Turkey would not lead to a sharp deterioration in Ankara's relations with NATO countries or its withdrawal from NATO. The deterioration of Ankara's relations with NATO is also considered harmful for Moscow. The military cooperation of Turkey with Russia as a NATO member and the possibility of reviving the partnership between NATO and Russia were studied.

To analyze the development of relations between Moscow and Ankara at the regional level, three main strategic regions were identified: the Middle East, the Black Sea (including the Caucasus) and Central Asia. The changes in the situation in the Middle East as a result of the "Arab Spring", the civil war in Syria, the Kurdish

issue in Iraq and Syria have determined the strategic directions of Moscow and Ankara in the region. Russia's participation in the Syrian civil war in the fall of 2015, which Ankara considers a threat to itself, led to a military incident on November 24, 2015. The incident was the result of a clash between Moscow and Ankara in the region. The "golden age" of bilateral relations has become a great test. As a result, relations between the two powers deteriorated, which led to the termination of political, economic, tourist and cultural relations. The deterioration of relations between Moscow and Ankara has also affected the countries of Central Asia. It is known that since the first years of independence, the Republic of Kazakhstan has chosen its foreign policy as a multi-vector one, which is due to the geopolitical realities of the modern world. It was proved that the positive image of Kazakhstan in the international arena, the principles of peacemaking and mediation in international disputes largely contributed to the revival of relations between Moscow and Ankara without further aggravation.

REFERENCES

- [1] Shlykov P., Ulchenko N. *Dinamika rossijsko-tureczkikh otnoshenij v usloviyakh narastaniya global'noj nestabil'nosti*. – Moskva, 2014. – 96 s [in Russ]
- [2] Demiryol T. Interdependence, balancing and conflict in Russian-Turkish relations. In *Great Powers and Geopolitics: International Affairs in a Rebalancing World* / K. Aharon (Eds). - Switzerland: Springer, 2015. - P. 65-87.
- [3] Çelikpala M. Turkey and the new energy politics of the black sea region // *Neighbourhood Policy*. – Bucharest, – January 2013. – №3 –17 p.
- [4] Erşen E. Turkey and Russia: an emerging “strategic axis” in Eurasia. – *EurOrient*, 2011. – P. 263–282.
- [5] Öniş Z. & Yılmaz Ş. Turkey and Russia in a shifting global order: cooperation, conflict and asymmetric interdependence in a turbulent region // *Third World Quarterly*. – 2015. – Vol. 37, № 1. – P. 71–95.
- [6] Bouveng K.R. *The role of messianism in contemporary Russian identity and statecraft*. - Durham University, 2010. – 327 p.
- [7] Doroszczyk J. Third Rome as Source of Anti-Western Russian Geopolitics // *History and Politics*. – 2018. – Vol. 24, №31. – P. 47–59.
- [8] Gereben, Á. Russia's energy weapon // *Hungarian Review*. – 2013. – № 01. – P. 33-40.

REFERENCES

- [1] Shlykov P., Ulchenko N. *Dinamika rossijsko-tureczkikh otnoshenij v usloviyakh narastaniya global'noj nestabil'nosti* (Dynamics of Russian-Turkish relations in the context of growing global instability) – Moskva, 2014. – 96 p [in Russ]
- [2] Demiryol T. Interdependence, balancing and conflict in Russian-Turkish relations. In *Great Powers and Geopolitics: International Affairs in a Rebalancing World* / K. Aharon (Eds). - Switzerland: Springer, 2015. - pp. 65-87.
- [3] Çelikpala M. Turkey and the new energy politics of the black sea region // *Neighbourhood Policy*. – Bucharest, – January 2013., No 3. – p.17
- [4] Erşen E. Turkey and Russia: an emerging “strategic axis” in Eurasia. – *EurOrient*, 2011., pp. 263–282.
- [5] Öniş Z. & Yılmaz Ş. Turkey and Russia in a shifting global order: cooperation, conflict and asymmetric interdependence in a turbulent region // *Third World Quarterly*. – 2015, Vol. 37, No 1. – pp. 71–95.

- [6] Bouveng K.R. The role of messianism in contemporary Russian identity and statecraft. - Durham University, 2010. – 327 p.
- [7] Doroszczyk J. Third Rome as Source of Anti-Western Russian Geopolitics // History and Politics. – 2018. – Vol. 24, No 31., pp. 47–59.
- [8] Gereben, Á. Russia's energy weapon // Hungarian Review. – 2013, No 01., pp. 33-40.

РЕСЕЙ МЕН ТҮРКИЯ: ҚАРАМА-ҚАЙШЫЛЫҚТАН ЫНТЫМАҚТАСТЫҚҚА

***Ермекбаев А¹. Абжапарова Л².**

¹PhD, доцент, әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ Ұлттық Университеті. Алматы, Қазақстан, E-mail: adilbekea@gmail.com

²PhD, доцент, Абылай хан атындағы ҚазХҚ және ӘТУ, Алматы, Қазақстан, e-mail: laura_zh83@mail.ru

Аңдатпа. Мақалада Ресей Федерациясы мен Түркия Республикасы арасындағы қарым-қатынастарға арналған. Бір-біріне қарама-қайшы саясат ұстанып келген, тарихы соғыс пен геосаяси текетіреске толы екі мемлекеттің қазіргі кезеңдегі серіктестігі халықаралық қатынастарда ерекше құбылыс ретінде қарастыруға қадам жасалады. Ғылыми жұмыста Ресей Федерациясы мен Түркия Республикасы арасындағы қарым-қатынастарының даму кезеңдері, қазіргі жағдайы мен болашағы зерделенген.

Қазіргі кезеңде халықаралық қатынастарда күрделі өзгерістер орын алуда, постбиполярлық әлемде жаңа ойыншылардың пайда болуы, олардың дәстүрлі күш орталықтарымен қарым-қатынастары бүгінгі таңдағы зерттеушілердің басты назарында.

Әлемде болып жатқан саяси процесстердің даму қарқынының өте жоғары болуы және орын алып жатқан оқиғалар кейде халықаралық қатынастар теориясы тұрғысынан анықтауға қиындық тудыруы байқалады. Қазіргі халықаралық қатынастар жүйесінде Ресей мен Түркия маңызды рөл атқарады деп есептейміз. Екі мемлекеттің әлемдік саясаттың жетекші акторларына айналуы мен халықаралық саясаттағы белсенділігі ХХІ ғасырдың басынан басталғаны анық. Ресей мен Түркияның арасындағы тығыз қарым-қатынастардың дамуы ғылыми ізденістердің өзекті бағытына айналды.

Тірек сөздер: Ресей, Түркия, конфронтация, геосаясат, неосманизм, путинизм.

РОССИЯ И ТУРЦИЯ: ОТ КОНФРОНТАЦИИ К СОТРУДНИЧЕСТВУ

***Ермекбаев А¹. Абжапарова Л².**

¹ PhD, доцент, Казахский национальный университет им. Аль-Фараби. Алматы, Казахстан, E-mail: adilbekea@gmail.com

² PhD, доцент, КазУМОиМЯ имени Абылай хана, Алматы, Казахстан, e-mail: laura_zh83@mail.ru

Аннотация. Статья посвящена отношениям между Российской Федерацией и Турецкой Республикой. Партнерство двух государств на современном этапе, история которых полна войны и геополитического противостояния, придерживающихся противоречивой политики, делает шаг к тому, чтобы рассматривать международные отношения как уникальное явление. В научной работе изучены этапы развития, современное состояние и перспективы отношений между Российской Федерацией и Турецкой Республикой.

На современном этапе происходят серьезные изменения в международных отношениях, появление новых игроков в постбиполярном мире, их отношения с традиционными центрами силы сегодня находятся в центре внимания исследователей.

Очень высокие темпы развития политических процессов, происходящих в мире, и происходящие события порой затрудняют их определение с точки зрения теории международных отношений. Мы считаем, что Россия и Турция играют важную роль в современной системе международных отношений. Очевидно, что становление двух государств ведущими акторами мировой политики и активность в международной политике началось с начала XXI века. Развитие тесных отношений между Россией и Турцией стало актуальным направлением научных изысканий.

Ключевые слова: Россия, Турция, конфронтация, геополитика, неоосманизм, путинизм.

Статья поступила 10.09.2021